



US Army Corps  
of Engineers®  
Buffalo District

# Harshaw Chemical Company Site Operable Unit 1

## Comparative Analysis of Proposed Plan Remedial Alternatives (Balancing Criteria)

CERCLA CRITERIA	ALTERNATIVE 1: No Action	ALTERNATIVE 2: Limited Action and Land Use Controls	Preferred Alternative
			ALTERNATIVE 3: Complete Removal with Off-Site Disposal
Overall protection of human health and the environment <sup>a</sup>	Not Protective	Protective	Protective
Compliance with ARARs	Not Compliant	Compliant	Compliant
Long-term effectiveness and permanence	Low	Moderate	High
Reduction of contaminant toxicity, mobility, or volume through treatment	None	None	None <sup>b</sup>
Short-term effectiveness	High	High	Moderate
Implementability <sup>c</sup>	Not Applicable	Low	High
Cost Present Worth	\$0	\$6,186,258	\$32,784,001

<sup>a</sup>Using industrial preliminary remediation goals.

<sup>b</sup>Waste minimization practices proposed under this alternative, such as radiological scanning and soil sorting, may reduce the volume of contaminated soil requiring disposal.

<sup>c</sup>The overall implementability is based on the lower of the ratings for technical and administrative implementability.